Implementation of Peer To Peer Supervision in Developing Competencies of Junior High School and Madrasah Tsanawiyah Teachers in Sekarbela District, Mataram

Supatah[1]*, Moh. Iwan Fitriani[1], Muhammad Thohri[1]

[1]Program Studi Manajemen Pendidikan Islam, Pascasarjana Universitas Islam Negeri Mataram, Indonesia
*Corresponding Author: supatah@gmail.com

Abstract: This study aims to explore the implementation of peer-to-peer supervision in developing teacher competencies at SMPN 17 Mataram and MTSN 3 Mataram. This research method employs a qualitative approach with a case study design. Data collection techniques include observation, interviews, and documentation. Data were analyzed using thematic analysis. The results of the study indicate that peer-to-peer supervision is effective in developing various teacher competencies, such as collaboration, communication, pedagogical knowledge, and technology integration. The positive outcomes include improved teacher competencies, conducive learning environments, and increased teacher comfort in facing evaluations. However, challenges include the lack of objectivity in assessments, suboptimal follow-up after supervision, and absence of an official schedule, affecting effectiveness. The implications emphasize the importance of implementing peer-to-peer supervision to enhance the quality of education in secondary schools. Future research could focus on addressing challenges and further exploring the impact of peer-to-peer supervision.

Keywords: Peer-To-Peer Supervision, Teacher Competencies, Junior High School, Madrasah Tsanawiyah, Education.

INTRODUCTION

Education is the foundation of social progress, and the quality of education heavily relies on the competencies of its educators. In Indonesia, continuous improvement in teacher competencies is crucial for enhancing the quality of education, especially at the Junior High School (SMP) and Madrasah Tsanawiyah (MTs) levels. Acknowledging this, educational institutions have explored various strategies to develop and enhance teacher competencies. One such strategy is peer-to-peer supervision (Kawata & Owan, 2022), involving teachers in observing and providing feedback to their colleagues to enhance teaching practices (Le & Howard, 2023). In the Sekarbela District of Mataram, the implementation of peer-to-peer supervision has garnered attention as a potential mechanism to enhance teacher competencies in SMP and MTs. This initiative aims to leverage the expertise and experiences of fellow educators to support professional growth and improve teaching quality (Jeong & Feldon, 2023). By fostering a collaborative learning environment, peer-to-peer supervision offers opportunities for teachers to share best practices, receive constructive feedback, and reflect on their teaching methods (Carvalho & Santos, 2022).

Exploring the implementation of peer-to-peer supervision and its impact on teacher competencies is significantly important in the context of improving the quality of education (Lam et al., 2024). Firstly, it enables the development of more effective teaching methods (Van De Mortel et al., 2021). Through peer-to-peer supervision, teachers can share best practices and provide constructive feedback, aiding in identifying areas for improvement and adopting more effective teaching strategies (Wong & Shorey, 2022). Secondly, this exploration can also enhance collaboration among teachers (Li et al., 2020). By involving teachers in the supervision process, peer-to-peer supervision can strengthen social bonds among educators and facilitate the exchange of ideas and experiences (Haryadi et al., 2021). This can create a more collaborative and supportive working culture among school staff, ultimately improving the effectiveness of teaching and learning (Nasri, 2023b).

Additionally, research on the impact of peer-to-peer supervision on teacher competencies can provide insights into factors influencing teacher learning (Nasri, 2019). By understanding how teachers respond to feedback from their peers and how it affects their performance (Nasri et al., 2016), policymakers and school administrators can design more relevant and effective professional development programs tailored to teachers' needs (Nurdiah et al., 2023). Furthermore, by enhancing teacher competencies, peer-to-peer supervision can also positively impact student learning outcomes (Atsani et al., 2023). Skilled and qualified teachers are more likely to present material effectively, provide more effective support to students, and create a positive and motivating learning environment (Irjanawadi et al., 2023). The exploration of peer-to-peer supervision implementation and its impact on teacher competencies is crucial for overall educational improvement (Nasri, 2024). By understanding the factors influencing the effectiveness of peer-to-peer supervision, schools and educational institutions can design more effective strategies for teacher professional development and improving student learning outcomes (Suparman et al., 2023).

The significance of this research lies in exploring the implementation of peer-to-peer supervision and its impact on teacher competencies in SMP and MTs in the Sekarbela District (Wang & Klassen, 2023). Understanding the effectiveness of this approach is essential for informing educational policies and practices aimed at enhancing teacher professional development and ultimately improving student learning outcomes (Adil et al., 2018). By examining the experiences and perceptions of teachers involved in peer-to-peer supervision, this research aims to provide insights into the potential benefits and challenges of this approach (Dwangu & Mahlangu, 2021). By providing an understanding of the implementation of peer-to-peer supervision in developing teacher competencies, this research contributes to existing literature on teacher professional development in the Indonesian context. Additionally, the findings of this research can provide information for educational stakeholders, including policymakers, school administrators, and teacher educators, in designing effective strategies to improve teacher competencies and

enhance the quality of education in SMP and MTs.

METHOD

This research employed a qualitative approach to investigate the implementation of peer-to-peer supervision and its impact on the competencies of Junior High School (SMP) and Madrasah Tsanawiyah (MTs) teachers in the Sekarbela District, Mataram (Yoong et al., 2023). Qualitative methods were chosen to explore the experiences, perceptions, and insights of teachers involved in peer-to-peer supervision in-depth (Nasri, 2023a).

Participants:

The participants of this study comprised SMP and MTs teachers who were involved in peer-to-peer supervision activities in the Sekarbela District, Mataram. Purposive sampling was utilized to select participants with diverse experiences and perspectives related to peer-to-peer supervision (Nasri et al., 2024).

Data Collection:

Data were collected through semi-structured interviews and focus group discussions (FGDs). Semi-structured interviews were conducted individually with selected teachers to explore their personal experiences, perceptions, and challenges regarding peer-to-peer supervision (Yan & Li, 2023). FGDs were organized to facilitate group discussions among teachers, allowing for the exploration of shared experiences and group dynamics related to peer-to-peer supervision (Birkett et al., 2022).

Data Analysis:

Thematic analysis was employed to analyze the qualitative data obtained from interviews and FGDs (Mihas, 2023). The analysis process involved several iterative steps, including familiarization with the data, coding, identifying themes, and interpreting the findings (Jacobs & Perez, 2023). Themes and patterns related to the implementation of peer-to-peer supervision and its impact on teacher competencies were identified and analyzed (Conrad et al., 2023).

Ethical Considerations:

Ethical considerations were carefully addressed throughout the research process. Informed consent was obtained from all

participants before data collection, ensuring voluntary participation and confidentiality. Participants were assured of anonymity, and their privacy rights were respected during data analysis and reporting (Bockhold et al., 2022).

Validity and Reliability:

To ensure the validity and reliability of the study findings, data triangulation techniques were employed. Multiple data sources, including interviews and FGDs, were utilized to corroborate findings and enhance the credibility of the study. Peer debriefing and member checking were also conducted to validate the interpretation of data and ensure the trustworthiness of the findings (Nagashima et al., 2024).

Limitations:

Despite efforts to ensure rigor and validity, this study may have limitations. The findings are context-specific and may not be generalizable to other settings. Additionally, the subjective nature of qualitative research introduces the possibility of researcher bias, which was mitigated through reflexivity and transparency in the research process (Pettit et al., 2022).

Overall, the qualitative methodology employed in this study provided a rich and comprehensive understanding of the implementation of peer-to-peer supervision and its impact on the competencies of SMP and MTs teachers in the Sekarbela District, Mataram.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

1. **Implementation of Peer-to-Peer Supervision in SMPN 17 Mataram**
   a. Supervision activities in SMPN 17 Mataram encompassed various forms, including administrative teaching arrangements, assessment of teaching materials, following teaching steps, and were conducted in stages: Planning, Implementation, Evaluation, and Follow-up.
   b. Dominant teacher competencies developed through peer-to-peer supervision included collaboration and communication skills, pedagogical knowledge, and the use of technology in teaching.

2. **Implementation of Peer-to-Peer Supervision in MTSN 3 Mataram**

a. Peer-to-peer supervision activities in MTSN 3 Mataram involved setting learning objectives, understanding taught materials, analyzing learning characteristics, and assessing the teaching process.
b. Dominant teacher competencies developed through peer-to-peer supervision included self-reflection, collaboration and communication skills, active learning skills development, and pedagogical knowledge.

3. **Positive Aspects of Peer-to-Peer Supervision:**
3.1. In SMPN 17 Mataram:
   a. Increased teacher competencies were noted, fostering a conducive learning environment.
   b. Teachers felt more comfortable and open in facing the evaluation process.
3.2. In MTSN 3 Mataram:
   a. Higher motivation among teachers was observed after the supervision process.
   b. Improvement in teaching quality and increased awareness among teachers and other school members regarding democratic and cooperative work processes.

4. **Negative Aspects of Peer-to-Peer Supervision:**
4.1. In SMPN 17 Mataram:
   a. Lack of objectivity in the assessment process.
   b. Suboptimal follow-up actions after supervision.
   c. Absence of a formal schedule set by the school resulted in less effective implementation, as it had to accommodate the busy schedules of teachers undergoing supervision.

4.2. In MTSN 3 Mataram:
   a. Subjective evaluations were observed frequently.
   b. Lack of benchmarks to ascertain whether the conducted supervision was accurate.
   c. Varied interpretations during supervision activities.
   d. Disharmonious relationships occurred when peers being supervised were unwilling to be open to receiving criticism.

The findings reveal the multifaceted nature of peer-to-peer supervision implementation and its impact on teacher competencies in both

SMPN 17 Mataram and MTSN 3 Mataram. While positive outcomes such as enhanced competencies and improved learning environments were evident, challenges such as subjective evaluations and lack of objectivity in assessments need to be addressed. These findings underscore the importance of refining peer-to-peer supervision processes to maximize its benefits and minimize its limitations in developing teacher competencies.

Discussion

The findings from the implementation of peer-to-peer supervision in SMPN 17 Mataram and MTSN 3 Mataram provide valuable insights into the dynamics of teacher professional development and the impact of collaborative supervision approaches on teacher competencies. These findings can be contextualized and discussed in relation to relevant theories in the field of education and teacher development.

1. Social Constructivism and Collaborative Learning:

The positive aspects of peer-to-peer supervision, such as increased collaboration and communication skills among teachers, resonate with the principles of social constructivism. According to social constructivist theory, learning is a social process that occurs through interactions with others, and collaborative learning environments promote knowledge construction and skill development (Do et al., 2023). The collaborative nature of peer-to-peer supervision fosters a supportive learning community where teachers can share experiences, exchange ideas, and collectively problem-solve. This aligns with the notion of communities of practice (Sayaf, 2023), where learning occurs through participation in social groups with shared goals and interests.

2. Reflective Practice and Professional Growth:

The findings regarding the development of self-reflection skills among teachers in MTSN 3 Mataram highlight the importance of reflective practice in teacher professional development. Reflective practice, as theorized by Schön (2020), involves critically analyzing one's teaching practices, beliefs, and experiences to improve teaching effectiveness. Through peer-to-peer supervision, teachers engage in reflective dialogue, which deepens their understanding of their teaching practices and promotes continuous professional growth. Additionally, the identification of dominant teacher competencies such as pedagogical knowledge and active learning skills development underscores the role of reflective practice in enhancing teaching effectiveness and student learning outcomes (Zeichner & Liston, 2019).

3. Supervisory Feedback and Teacher Development:

The challenges related to subjective evaluations and lack of objectivity in the assessment process in both schools highlight the importance of effective supervisory feedback in teacher development. Supervisory feedback, when provided constructively and objectively, can serve as a catalyst for professional growth and improvement (Hattie & Timperley, 2018). The discrepancies in interpretations during supervision activities underscore the need for clear communication and shared understanding of evaluation criteria. This resonates with the principles of effective feedback outlined by Hattie and Timperley (2021), which emphasize clarity, specificity, and actionable recommendations.

In conclusion, the discussion of the findings in light of relevant theories emphasizes the importance of collaborative and reflective approaches to teacher professional development. Peer-to-peer supervision offers a promising avenue for enhancing teacher competencies, promoting collaborative learning, and fostering reflective practice. However, to realize its full potential, efforts should be directed towards addressing challenges related to assessment objectivity and ensuring clear communication and understanding of evaluation criteria among participants. By integrating theory-driven practices, such as social constructivism, reflective practice, and effective feedback, peer-to-peer supervision can become a powerful tool for promoting teacher development and improving educational outcomes.

CONCLUSION

The implementation of peer-to-peer supervision in SMPN 17 Mataram and MTSN 3 Mataram has yielded valuable insights into its impact on teacher competencies and professional development. Despite encountering both positive aspects and challenges, peer-to-peer supervision

has demonstrated its potential as an effective mechanism for fostering collaboration, enhancing teaching practices, and promoting reflective learning among teachers. The findings suggest that peer-to-peer supervision has contributed to the development of various teacher competencies, including collaboration and communication skills, pedagogical knowledge, and self-reflection. In SMPN 17 Mataram, the collaborative nature of supervision has led to increased teacher competencies, creating a conducive learning environment and fostering openness to evaluation. Similarly, in MTSN 3 Mataram, peer-to-peer supervision has motivated teachers, improved teaching quality, and raised awareness of democratic and cooperative work processes. However, challenges such as subjective evaluations, lack of objectivity in assessments, and discrepancies in interpretations during supervision activities have been identified. Addressing these challenges is crucial to maximizing the effectiveness of peer-to-peer supervision and ensuring its sustainability as a professional development tool for teachers.

Recommendations:
1. Establish Clear Evaluation Criteria:
Develop clear and objective evaluation criteria and rubrics to guide peer-to-peer supervision activities. This will ensure consistency in assessments and minimize subjective interpretations.
2. Provide Training and Support:
Offer training sessions and workshops to teachers on effective supervision techniques, providing constructive feedback, and fostering a culture of collaboration and reflection. Continuous support and mentoring can enhance teachers' confidence and skills in conducting peer-to-peer supervision.
3. Implement Structured Follow-up Mechanisms:
Establish structured follow-up mechanisms to ensure that feedback from peer-to-peer supervision is effectively incorporated into teaching practices. Regular follow-up meetings and action plans can facilitate continuous improvement and accountability.
4. Foster a Culture of Openness and Trust:
Promote a culture of openness, trust, and mutual respect among teachers participating in peer-to-peer supervision. Encourage constructive dialogue, active listening, and receptiveness to feedback to create a supportive learning environment.

5. Monitor and Evaluate:
Regularly monitor and evaluate the implementation of peer-to-peer supervision to identify areas for improvement and measure its impact on teacher competencies and student learning outcomes. Adjustments and refinements should be made based on feedback and evidence-based practices.
6. Share Best Practices:
Facilitate the sharing of best practices and success stories among schools and educators to inspire innovation and collaboration. Establish platforms for knowledge exchange and networking to enhance professional learning communities.

By implementing these recommendations, educational institutions and policymakers can harness the full potential of peer-to-peer supervision as a means to develop teacher competencies, improve teaching quality, and ultimately enhance the overall quality of education in SMP and MTs.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

REFERENCES

Adil, N., Rashidi, Z., & Frooghi, R. (2018). Strengthening school management committees: A framework for process and outcome. *International Journal of Educational Management*, *32*(4), 701–718. https://doi.org/10.1108/IJEM-03-2017-0072

Atsani, L. G. M. Z., Nasri, U., Walad, M., & Nurdiah, N. (2023). Management of the Nahdlatul Wathan Lombok Qur'an Home

Education Strategy in Creating Qur'anic Generations. *Al Hikmah: Journal of Education*, *4*(1), 77–92. https://doi.org/10.54168/ahje.v4i1.150

Birkett, M., Melville, J., Janulis, P., Phillips, G., Contractor, N., & Hogan, B. (2022). Reprint of: Network Canvas: Key decisions in the design of an interviewer-assisted network data collection software suite. *Social Networks*, *69*, 263–273. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socnet.2022.01.006

Bockhold, S., McNulty, J., Abdurakman, E., Bezzina, P., Drey, N., England, A., Flinton, D., Khine, R., McEntee, M., Mekiš, N., Precht, H., Rainford, L., Sá Dos Reis, C., Santos, A., Syrgiamiotis, V., Willis, S., Woodley, J., Beardmore, C., Harris, R., … Malamateniou, C. (2022). Research ethics training, challenges, and suggested improvements across Europe: Radiography research ethics standards for Europe (RRESFE). *Radiography*, *28*(4), 1016–1024. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.radi.2022.07.004

Carvalho, A. R., & Santos, C. (2022). Developing peer mentors' collaborative and metacognitive skills with a technology-enhanced peer learning program. *Computers and Education Open*, *3*, 100070. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.caeo.2021.100070

Conrad, M., Steffensmeier, K. S., Van Tiem, J., Obrecht, A., Mares, J., Mosher, H. J., Weg, M. W. V., Sibenaller, Z., Stout, L., Patel, P., & Hadlandsmyth, K. (2023). Military Veterans' Perspectives on Postoperative Opioid Use: A Secondary Analysis of Qualitative Data. *Journal of PeriAnesthesia Nursing*, *38*(3), 483–487. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jopan.2022.09.006

Do, H.-N., Do, B. N., & Nguyen, M. H. (2023). 3How do constructivism learning environments generate better motivation and learning strategies? The Design Science Approach. *Heliyon*, *9*(12), e22862. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e22862

Dwangu, A. M., & Mahlangu, V. P. (2021). Accountability in the financial management practices of school principals. *International Journal of Educational Management*, *35*(7), 1504–1524. https://doi.org/10.1108/IJEM-06-2021-0243

Haryadi, L. F., Nasri, U., & Walad, M. (2021). *Manajemen Pondok Pesantren: Teori Manajemen Lembaga Pendidikan Islam di perguruan Tinggi*. CV. Haramain Lombok.

Irjanawadi, L., Zaki, M., Al Idrus, S. A. J., & Nasri, U. (2023). Manajemen Pembinaan Ekstrakurikuler di Pondok Pesantren Irsyadul Mujahidin NW Teliah Desa Sakra Selatan Kecamatan Sakra Lombok Timur. *Jurnal Ilmiah Profesi Pendidikan*, *8*(1), 125–132. https://doi.org/10.29303/jipp.v8i1.1166

Jacobs, J., & Perez, J. I. (2023). A qualitative metasynthesis of teacher educator self-studies on social justice: Articulating a social justice pedagogy. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, *123*, 103994. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2022.103994

Jeong, S., & Feldon, D. F. (2023). Changes in self-regulated learning profiles during an undergraduate peer-based intervention: A latent profile transition analysis. *Learning and Instruction*, *83*, 101710. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.learninstruc.2022.101710

Kawata, Y., & Owan, H. (2022). Peer effects on job satisfaction from exposure to elderly workers. *Journal of the Japanese and International Economies*, *63*, 101183. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jjie.2021.101183

Lam, A. H. Y., Ho, L. M. K., Lam, S. K. K., Chan, C. K. Y., Chan, M. M. K., Pun, M. W. M., & Wang, K. M. P. (2024). Effectiveness and experiences of integrating Mindfulness into Peer-assisted Learning (PAL) in clinical education for nursing students: A mixed method study. *Nurse Education Today*, *132*, 106039. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nedt.2023.106039

Le, S., & Howard, M. L. (2023). Peer evaluation of teaching programs within pharmacy education: A review of the literature. *Currents in Pharmacy Teaching and Learning*, *15*(11), 984–992. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cptl.2023.09.009

Li, L., Liu, Y., Peng, Z., Liao, M., Lu, L., Liao, H., & Li, H. (2020). Peer relationships, motivation, self-efficacy, and science

literacy in ethnic minority adolescents in China: A moderated mediation model. *Children and Youth Services Review*, *119*, 105524. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.childyouth.2020.105524

Mihas, P. (2023). Qualitative research methods: Approaches to qualitative data analysis. In *International Encyclopedia of Education (Fourth Edition)* (pp. 302–313). Elsevier. https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-818630-5.11029-2

Nagashima, M., Omokawa, S., Hasegawa, H., Nakanishi, Y., Kawamura, K., & Tanaka, Y. (2024). Reliability and Validity Analysis of the Distal Radioulnar Joint Ballottement Test. *The Journal of Hand Surgery*, *49*(1), 15–22. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhsa.2023.10.006

Nasri, U. (2019). *Philosophy is Mother of Science: Pengantar Filsafat*. CV. Haramain Lombok.

Nasri, U. (2023a). Exploring Qualitative Research: A Comprehensive Guide to Case Study Methodology. *Al-Hikmah: Jurnal Studi Islam*, *4*(3), 72–85.

Nasri, U. (2023b). *Philosophy of Education*. CV. Haramain Lombok.

Nasri, U. (2024). Rethinking Religious Moderation: Revitalisasi Konsep Manusia Perspektif Filsafat Pendidikan Islam dalam Konteks Multikultural. *Jurnal Ilmiah Profesi Pendidikan*, *9*(1), 213–220. https://doi.org/10.29303/jipp.v9i1.1655

Nasri, U., Nuha, U., & Nabila, Y. (2024). Literature Review And Practical Guide: Bibliographic Research Method In The Formation Of Conceptual Framework. *BIMSALABIM: Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran*, *1*(1), 10–16.

Nasri, U., Umar, Bekti, A. B., Fauzina, M., Zarkasi, Kahar, Sudirman, Musni, L., B, E. W., Hairiyah, S., Pransiska, E., Nurjanah, S., Mahmudah, H. I., Astanti, E. Y., & Nuryana, Z. (2016). *Pengembangan Kurikulum Pendidikan Agama Islam Transformatif.* Deepublish.

Nurdiah, N., Suprapto, S., Maujud, F., & Nasri, U. (2023). Manajemen Rumah Qur'an dalam Mencetak Generasi Qur'ani: (Studi Kasus di Rumah Qur'an Nahdlatul Wathan Lombok Yayasan Pondok Tahfidz Baqiyatussalaf Nahdlatul Wathan). *Jurnal Ilmiah Profesi Pendidikan*, *8*(1), 161–170. https://doi.org/10.29303/jipp.v8i1.1167

Pettit, M. H., Kanavathy, S., McArthur, N., Weiss, O., & Khanduja, V. (2022). Measurement Techniques for Leg Length Discrepancy in Total Hip Arthroplasty: A Systematic Review of Reliability and Validity. *The Journal of Arthroplasty*, *37*(12), 2507-2516.e11. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.arth.2022.05.029

Sayaf, A. M. (2023). Adoption of E-learning systems: An integration of ISSM and constructivism theories in higher education. *Heliyon*, *9*(2), e13014. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e13014

Suparman, S., Nasri, U., & Zulkifli, Muh. (2023). Recontextualization of Islamic Educational Thought within Fazlur Rahman's Intellectual Framework. *Jurnal Ilmiah Profesi Pendidikan*, *8*(4), 1945–1950. https://doi.org/10.29303/jipp.v8i4.1639

Van De Mortel, T. F., Needham, J., & Henderson, S. (2021). Facilitating learning on clinical placement using near-peer supervision: A mixed methods study. *Nurse Education Today*, *102*, 104921. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nedt.2021.104921

Wang, H., & Klassen, R. M. (2023). Longitudinal relationships between teachers' utility values and quitting intentions: A person-organization fit perspective. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, *127*, 104109. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2023.104109

Wong, B. S. H., & Shorey, S. (2022). Nursing students' experiences and perception of peer feedback: A qualitative systematic review. *Nurse Education Today*, *116*, 105469. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nedt.2022.105469

Yan, Z., & Li, Y. (2023). Data collection optimization of ocean observation network based on AUV path planning and communication. *Ocean Engineering*, *282*, 114912. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.oceaneng.2023.114912

Yoong, S. Q., Wang, W., Seah, A. C. W., & Zhang, H. (2023). The quality of verbal feedback given by nursing near-peer tutors: A qualitative study. *Nurse*

Education Today, *130*, 105944.
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nedt.2023.10594
4